

# AN ANALOGUE OF THE ERDŐS-STONE THEOREM FOR FINITE GEOMETRIES

JIM GEELEN AND PETER NELSON

ABSTRACT. For a set  $G$  of points in  $PG(m-1, q)$ , let  $ex_q(G; n)$  denote the maximum size of a collection of points in  $PG(n-1, q)$  not containing a copy of  $G$ , up to projective equivalence. We show that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{ex_q(G; n)}{|PG(n-1, q)|} = 1 - q^{1-c},$$

where  $c$  is the smallest integer such that there is a rank- $(m-c)$  flat in  $PG(m-1, q)$  that is disjoint from  $G$ . The result is an elementary application of the density version of the Hales-Jewett Theorem.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Note that if  $M$  is a rank- $(r-c+1)$  flat of  $PG(r-1, q)$ , then  $|M| = \frac{q^{r-c+1}-1}{q-1}$  and each rank- $m$  flat of  $PG(r-1, q)$  intersects  $M$  in a flat of rank at least  $m-c+1$ . Our main result is the following:

**Theorem 1.1** (Main Theorem). *For each prime-power  $q$ , all integers  $m > c \geq 0$ , and any real number  $\epsilon > 0$ , there is an integer  $R = R_{1.1}(m, q, c, \epsilon)$  such that, if  $n > R$  and  $G$  is a set of points in  $PG(n-1, q)$  with  $|G| \leq (1-\epsilon) \left( \frac{q^{n-c+1}-1}{q-1} \right)$ , then there exists a rank- $m$  flat  $F$  of  $PG(n-1, q)$  such that  $\text{rank}(F \cap G) \leq m-c$ .*

We were motivated by a problem in extremal matroid theory posed by Kung [7]; the matroidal origins of the problem are reflected in our terminology which we briefly review below.

Let  $\mathbb{F}$  be a finite field of order  $q$  and let  $V$  be a rank- $r$  vector space over  $\mathbb{F}$ . A *rank- $k$  flat* of  $PG(r-1, \mathbb{F})$  is a  $(k+1)$ -dimensional subspace of  $V$ ; the *points* are the rank-1 flats; the *lines* are the rank-2 flats; and the *hyperplanes* are the rank- $(r-1)$  flats. Technically the projective geometry depends on the particular vector space  $V$ ; to make this explicit, we write  $PG(V)$  for the projective geometry given by  $V$ .

---

*Date:* March 9, 2012.

*1991 Mathematics Subject Classification.* 05B35.

*Key words and phrases.* matroids, Erdős-Stone Theorem, Bose-Burton Theorem, Hales-Jewett Theorem, projective geometries, critical exponent.

We refer to a set  $H$  of points in  $PG(r-1, \mathbb{F})$ , for some  $r$ , as a *geometry over  $\mathbb{F}$*  and we define  $rank(H)$  to be the rank of the flat spanned by  $H$ . If  $H$  and  $G$  are geometries over  $\mathbb{F}$ , then there are vector spaces  $V_1$  and  $V_2$  over  $\mathbb{F}$  so that  $H$  is a spanning set of points in  $PG(V_1)$  and  $G$  is a spanning set of points in  $PG(V_2)$ . We say that  $H$  is a *restriction of  $G$*  or that  $G$  *contains  $H$* , if there is a rank-preserving projective transformation from  $V_2$  to a vector space  $V_2'$  containing  $V_1$  so that  $H$  is contained in the image of  $G$ .

For a geometry  $H$  over  $\mathbb{F}$  and positive integer  $n$ , we let  $ex_q(H; n)$  denote the maximum number of points in a rank- $n$  geometry over  $\mathbb{F}$  not containing  $H$ .

For integers  $0 \leq c \leq m$ , let  $F$  be a rank- $(m-c)$  flat of  $PG(m-1, q)$  and let  $G(m-1, q, c)$  be the geometry obtained by restricting  $PG(m-1, q)$  to the complement of  $F$ ; thus  $G(m-1, q, m) = PG(m-1, q)$  and  $G(m-1, q, 1) = AG(m-1, q)$ , the rank- $m$  affine geometry over  $GF(q)$ . The *critical exponent* of  $H$  over  $GF(q)$ , written  $c(H; q)$ , is the minimum  $c$  such that  $H$  is contained in  $G(m-1, q, c)$ . The critical exponent was introduced by Crapo and Rota [3] and is related to the chromatic number of a graph.

The following result, which is an easy corollary of Theorem 1.1, was all but conjectured by Kung [7].

**Theorem 1.2.** *Let  $\mathbb{F}$  be a finite field of order  $q$ . If  $H$  is a geometry over  $\mathbb{F}$  with critical exponent  $c > 0$ , then*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{ex_q(H; n)}{|PG(n-1, q)|} = 1 - q^{1-c}.$$

This theorem bears a striking resemblance to the following theorem of Erdős and Stone [4]. For a graph  $H$ , let  $ex(H; n)$  denote the maximum number of edges in a simple  $n$ -vertex graph that does not contain a subgraph isomorphic to  $H$ . The *chromatic-number*,  $\chi(G)$ , of a graph  $G$  is the minimum number of colours needed to colour the vertices so that no two adjacent vertices get the same colour.

**Theorem 1.3** (Erdős-Stone Theorem). *For any graph  $H$  with chromatic-number  $\chi \geq 2$ ,*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{ex(H; n)}{\binom{n}{2}} = 1 - \frac{1}{\chi - 1}.$$

## 2. OLD RESULTS

In this section we briefly review related results. Note that  $G(n-1, q, m-1)$  does not contain  $PG(m-1, q)$ ; Bose and Burton [2] showed

that  $G(n-1, q, m-1)$  is extremal among geometries not containing  $PG(m-1, q)$ .

**Theorem 2.1.** *Let  $\mathbb{F}$  be a field of order  $q$  and  $m$  and  $r$  be integers with  $n \geq m \geq 0$ . Then*

$$ex_q(PG(m-1, \mathbb{F}); n) = |G(n-1, q, m-1)|.$$

Bonin and Qin [1] determine  $ex_q(H; n)$  exactly for several other interesting families of geometries.

Our main result is an easy application of the following deep result due to Furstenberg and Katznelson [5, Theorem 9.10] in 1985.

**Theorem 2.2.** *For each field  $\mathbb{F}$  of order  $q$ , integer  $m \geq 2$ , and real number  $\epsilon > 0$ , there is an integer  $R = R_{2.2}(m, q, \epsilon)$  such that,*

$$ex_q(AG(m-1, \mathbb{F}); n) < \epsilon |PG(n-1, q)|$$

for all  $n > R$ .

This result can be obtained as an easy application of the density version of the multidimensional Hales-Jewett theorem, also proved by Furstenberg and Katznelson [6], in 1991, using ergodic theory. An easier proof was later obtained via the polymath project [8]. The “easier proof” is still, however, more than 30 pages long. Bonin and Qin [1] have a much simpler proof of Theorem 2.2 in the case that  $q = 2$ .

### 3. NEW RESULTS

We start with a proof of Theorem 1.1; for convenience we restate it in a complementary form. (The equivalence between the two statements is easy and is left to the reader.)

**Theorem 3.1** (Reformulation of Theorem 1.1). *For any integers  $m > c \geq 1$  and real number  $\epsilon > 0$ , there is an integer  $R = R_{3.1}(m, q, c, \epsilon)$  such that,*

$$ex_q(G(m-1, q, c); n) < (1 - q^{1-c} + \epsilon) |PG(n-1, q)|,$$

for all  $n > R$ .

*Proof.* Let  $m > c \geq 1$  be integers and let  $\epsilon > 0$  be a real number. The proof is by induction on  $c$ ; the case that  $c = 1$  follows directly from Theorem 2.2. Assume that  $c > 1$  and that the result holds for  $c - 1$ .

Let  $r = R_{2.2}(m - c + 1, q, \epsilon/2)$ , let  $t$  be sufficiently large so that  $q^{1-c}(q^r - 1) \leq \frac{\epsilon}{2}(q^n - q^r)$  for all  $n > t$ , and define

$$R_{3.1}(m, q, c, \epsilon) = \max(t, R_{3.1}(r, q, c-1, q^{2-c} - q^{1-c})).$$

Now let  $n > R_{3.1}(m, q, c, \epsilon)$  and let  $M$  be a restriction of  $PG(n-1, q)$  with  $|M| \geq (1 - q^{1-c} + \epsilon)|PG(n-1, q)|$ .

By the inductive assumption,  $M$  has a  $G(r-1, q, c-1)$ -restriction. Thus there are flats  $F_0 \subseteq F_1$  of  $PG(n-1, q)$  such that  $\text{rank}(F_1) = r$ ,  $\text{rank}(F_0) = r - c + 1$ , and  $F_1 - F_0 \subseteq M$ . Let  $F_0^c \subseteq F_1$  be a rank- $(c-1)$  flat that is disjoint from  $F_0$ .

Note that, by our definition of  $t$ ,

$$|M \setminus F_1| \geq (1 - q^{1-c} + \frac{\epsilon}{2}) |PG(n-1, q) - F_1|.$$

So by an elementary averaging argument, there exists a rank- $(r+1)$  flat  $F_2$  containing  $F_1$  such that

$$|M \cap (F_2 - F_1)| \geq (1 - q^{1-c} + \frac{\epsilon}{2}) |F_2 - F_1| = (1 - q^{1-c})q^r + \frac{\epsilon}{2}q^r.$$

We want to find a rank- $m$  flat  $F \subseteq F_2$  such that  $F_0^c \subseteq F \not\subseteq F_1$  and  $F - F_1 \subseteq M$ . If  $F$  satisfies these conditions, then  $\text{rank}(F \cap F_0) = m - c$  and, hence, the restriction of  $M$  to  $F$  contains  $G(m-1, q, c)$ .

Let  $S = (F_2 - F_1) \cap M$ . For a flat  $F$  of  $PG(n-1, q)$  and point  $e \notin F$ , we let  $F + e$  denote the flat spanned by  $F \cup \{e\}$ . Let  $e \in F_2 - F_1$  and let  $Q = (F_0 + e) - F_0$ . Now, for each  $f \in Q$ , let  $S_f = (F_0^c + f) \cap S$ . Note that  $(S_f : f \in Q)$  partitions  $S$  and  $|S_f| \leq q^{c-1}$ . Finally, let  $Q_1$  be the set of all  $f \in Q$ , such that  $|S_f| = q^{c-1}$ .

All vectors in  $Q - Q_1$  extend to at most  $q^{c-1} - 1$  elements in  $S$ , so

$$\begin{aligned} (q^{c-1} - 1)q^{r-c+1} + |Q_1| &\geq |S| \\ &\geq (1 - q^{1-c} + \frac{\epsilon}{2}) q^r \\ &= (q^{c-1} - 1)q^{r-c+1} + \frac{\epsilon}{2}q^r. \end{aligned}$$

Thus  $|Q_1| \geq \frac{\epsilon}{2}q^r$ . By Theorem 2.2, there is a subset  $Q_2$  of  $Q_1$  such that  $Q_2 \cong AG(m-c, q)$ . Let  $F$  be the flat of  $PG(n-1, q)$  spanned by  $F_0^c$  and  $Q_2$ . Thus  $F$  has rank  $m$ ,  $F_0^c \subseteq F$ , and, since  $Q_2 \subseteq Q_1$ ,  $F - F_1 \subseteq M$ . So the restriction of  $M$  to  $F - F_0$  gives  $G(m-1, q, c)$ .  $\square$

We can now prove Theorem 1.2, which we restate here for convenience.

**Corollary 3.2.** *Let  $\mathbb{F}$  be a finite field of order  $q$ . If  $H$  is a geometry over  $\mathbb{F}$  with critical exponent  $c > 0$ , then*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{ex_q(H; n)}{|PG(n-1, q)|} = 1 - q^{1-c}.$$

*Proof.* Observe that  $H$  is a restriction of  $G(r(N)-1, q, c)$  but it is not a restriction of  $G(n-1, q, c-1)$ . Then, by Theorem 3.1, for all  $\epsilon > 0$

and all sufficiently large  $n$ ,

$$\frac{q^n}{q^n - 1}(1 - q^{1-c}) = \frac{|G(n-1, q, c-1)|}{|PG(n-1, q)|} \leq \frac{ex_q(H; n)}{|PG(n-1, q)|} \leq 1 - q^{1-c} + \epsilon,$$

so the result holds.  $\square$

The value of  $R_{3.1}(m, q, c, \epsilon)$  provided by Theorem 3.1 depends on that of  $R_{2.2}(m, q, \epsilon)$ , for which the bounds in [8] are Ackermann-like for all  $q > 2$ . In the binary case, however, the main theorem of [1] implies that the relatively small function  $R_{2.2}(m, 2, \epsilon) = 2^{m-2} \lceil 1 - \log_2 \epsilon \rceil$  will satisfy Theorem 2.2. From this, one can derive from the proof that  $R_{3.1}(m, 2, c, \epsilon) = T_c(m + d)$  will satisfy Theorem 3.1, where  $d = \lceil \log_2 \lceil (2 - \log_2 \epsilon) \rceil \rceil$ , and  $T_c$  is the tower function recursively defined by  $T_0(s) = s$  and  $T_i(s) = T_{i-1}(2^s)$  for all  $i > 0$ .

#### REFERENCES

- [1] J.E. Bonin, H. Qin, Size functions of subgeometry-closed classes of representable combinatorial geometries, *Discrete Math.* 224, (2000) 37-60.
- [2] R.C. Bose, R.C. Burton, A characterization of flat spaces in a finite geometry and the uniqueness of the Hamming and MacDonal codes, *J. Combin. Theory* 1, (1966) 96-104.
- [3] H.H. Crapo, G.-C. Rota, *On the foundations of combinatorial theory: Combinatorial geometries*, M.I.T. Press, Cambridge, Mass., 1970.
- [4] P. Erdős, A.H. Stone, On the structure of linear graphs, *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.* 52, (1946) 1087-1091.
- [5] H. Furstenberg, Y. Katznelson, An ergodic Szemerédi theorem for IP-systems and combinatorial theory, *Journal d'Analyse Mathématique* 45, (1985) 117-168.
- [6] H. Furstenberg, Y. Katznelson, A density version of the Hales-Jewett Theorem, *J. d'Analyse Mathématique* 57 (1991) 64-119.
- [7] J.P.S. Kung, Extremal matroid theory, in: *Graph Structure Theory*, N. Robertson and P.D. Seymour, eds. (Amer. Math. Soc., Providence RI, 1993), 21-61.
- [8] D.H.J. Polymath, A new proof of the density Hales-Jewett theorem, arXiv:0910.3926v2 [math.CO], (2010) 1-34.

DEPARTMENT OF COMBINATORICS AND OPTIMIZATION, UNIVERSITY OF WATERLOO, WATERLOO, CANADA

SCHOOL OF MATHEMATICS, STATISTICS AND OPERATIONS RESEARCH, VICTORIA UNIVERSITY, WELLINGTON, NEW ZEALAND